Matching to Improve Balance in Covariate Distributions

DongYoon Yang September 19, 2022

Seoul National University



2 Theoretical Property of Matching Method

Model-Based Inference for Completely Randomized Experiments



2 Theoretical Property of Matching Method

Model-Based Inference for Completely Randomized Experiments

- N_t : the number of treated units.
- N_c : the number of controlled units.

•
$$I'_c = \{N_t + 1, \cdots, N_t + N_c\}$$

• Choose a subset
$$I_c \subset I'_c$$

•
$$\mathcal{M}_{1}^{c} := \left\{ j \in \mathrm{I}_{c}' : d(X_{1}, X_{j}) = \min_{j' \in \mathrm{I}_{c}'} d(X_{1}, X_{j}') \right\}$$

•
$$\mathcal{M}_{i}^{c} := \left\{ j \in \mathrm{I}_{c}^{\prime} - \cup_{i^{\prime}=1}^{i-1} \mathcal{M}_{i^{\prime}}^{c} : d(X_{1}, X_{j}) = \min_{j \in \mathrm{I}_{c}^{\prime} - \cup_{i^{\prime}=1}^{i-1} \mathcal{M}_{i^{\prime}}^{c}} d(X_{1}, X_{j}^{\prime}) \right\}$$

The choice of distance metric d

• Mahalanobis Metric

$$d_M(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') = (\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}')^\top \widehat{\Sigma}^{-1} (\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}')$$

where $\widehat{\Sigma} = rac{N_c \cdot \widehat{\Sigma}_c + N_t \cdot \widehat{\Sigma}_t}{N_c + N_t}$

- e(x) : propensity score
- Linearized propensity score

$$d_\ell(\pmb{x},\pmb{x}') = (\ell(\pmb{x})-\ell(\pmb{x}'))^2$$
 where $\ell(\pmb{x}) = \log rac{e(\pmb{x})}{1-e(\pmb{x})}$

Rejecting and Caliper Matching

- Rejecting Matching
- In some cases, even the closest match may not be close enough.
- Drop treated units if

$$|\ell(\mathbf{x}_i) - \ell(\mathbf{x}_{m_i})| > d_{\max}$$

- Caliper Matching
- Assign to treated unit i=1 all control units $j\in {\rm I}_c'$ such that

$$d(X_1, X_j) \leq d_{cal}$$



2 Theoretical Property of Matching Method

Model-Based Inference for Completely Randomized Experiments

Equal Percentage Bias Reduction (EPBR)

- $X_t \sim N(\mu_t, \Sigma)$
- $X_c \sim N(\mu_c, \Sigma)$
- $\mathbb{E}[Y_i(0)|X_i=\mathbf{x}_i]=\mathbf{x}_i^\top\boldsymbol{\beta} \ \forall i$
- μ_c^M : mean of control groups after matching.
- $\tau_{sp,t} = \mathbb{E}[Y_i(1) Y_i(0)|W_i = 1]$

The expected bias of $\hat{\tau}^{\rm diff}$ in observed data is

$$\mathbb{E}[\underbrace{\bar{Y}_{t}^{\text{obs}} - \bar{Y}_{c}^{\text{obs}}}_{\hat{\tau}^{\text{diff}}} - \tau_{sp,t}] = (\mu_{t} - \mu_{c})^{\top} \beta$$
(1)

Definition

Matching method is called equal percentage bias reducing (EPBR) if $\exists c_M$ with $0 < c_M < 1$ such that $(\mu_t - \mu_c^M)\beta = c_M(\mu_t - \mu_c)\beta \ \forall \beta$.

- The only EPBR matching methods improves the bias for every linear predictor.
- Both propensity score and Mahalanobis matching methods are epbr.
- Propensity score Matching
- scalar matching, small samples, non-robust to model misspecification(parametric).
- Mahalanobis matching
- vector matching, large samples, robust to model misspecification(nonparametric).